

10.6 RFT IE252/2023 LEEDERVILLE OVAL GRANDSTAND ROOF REPAIR

Attachments: 1. Evaluation Summary - Confidential

RECOMMENDATION:

That Council:

1. **NOTES** the outcome of the evaluation process for Tender IE252/2023 Leederville Oval Grandstand Roof Repair;
2. **ACCEPTS** the tender submission of Kilmore Group for Tender IE252/2023 Leederville Oval Grandstand Roof Repair; and
3. **AUTHORISES** the CEO to submit a Phase 4 Work Schedule project nomination for the Leederville Grandstand roof renewal to be part funded by the LRCI program of \$270,557.

PURPOSE OF REPORT:

For Council to –

- 1) consider and determine the outcomes of Tender IE252/2023 Leederville Oval Grandstand Roof Repair; and
- 2) consider addressing the shortfall of budget for the Leederville Oval Grandstand project with funding through the Phase 4 LRCI program of \$270,557.

BACKGROUND:

The Leederville Oval Grandstand was constructed circa 1960 in preparation for the 1962 British Empire and Commonwealth Games making it over 60 years old.

The Grandstand structure comprises a steel framed cantilevered roof, with concrete suspended floors, precast concrete seating and brick facade. The structure covers an approximate footprint of 16 m x 40m which is covered by a large, cantilevered roof approximately 16m above ground level.

During a storm event in August 2022 the roof structure experienced failures to the bolted connection of the purlins allowing the purlins and roof sheeting to lift during the storm. Emergency remediation was carried out, comprising screw fixing the purlins to the cleats which was certified as a temporary measure, to last a maximum of 12 months.

The City engaged Lalli Consulting Engineers to carry out a full structural inspection and assessment of the Leederville Oval Grandstand. The report provides the City with a clear understanding of the buildings structural condition and has provided recommendations for remediation and repair works which are required to ensure the structure is safe and serviceable. Critical works identified included the installation of a Helifix remedial tie system to the western brick façade and some concrete remediation to the substructure of the grandstand. These works were completed in June 2023.

The City has now sought offers from suitably qualified and experienced contractors to carry out major repair works on the Leederville Oval Grandstand Roof and scheduled to minimise impact to the 2023 WAFL season.

It is proposed to submit this project for the Phase 4 LRCI program funding as it is an eligible project that involves the construction, maintenance and/or improvements to council-owned assets that are primarily for the direct use and benefit of the local community. This would provide the additional funding required to address a high-risk community infrastructure issue.

DETAILS:

Submissions were received from three (3) Respondents:

Respondent 1	Barpa Pty Ltd
Respondent 2	Colgan Industries Pty Ltd
Respondent 3	Kilmore Group

Evaluation Panel

The Evaluation Panel comprised of five members, being:

- one with tender preparation skills;
- two with the appropriate operational expertise and involvement in supervising the contract;
- one with probity advice provided by a Procurement and Contracts Officer.

Compliance Assessment

All three (3) offers received were assessed as fully compliant and progressed to the qualitative assessment stage.

Evaluation Method and Weighting

The qualitative weighting method of tender evaluation was selected to evaluate the offer.

The qualitative criteria and weighting used in evaluating the submission received were as follows:

Qualitative Criteria		Weighting
1	Capacity, Skills and Experience	30%
2	Health and Safety	30%
3	Project Understanding	30%
4	Environmental and Social	10%

Qualitative Assessment

Respondent #	Respondent Name	Weighted Percentage Score	Qualitative Ranking
Respondent 1	Barpa Pty Ltd	74%	2
Respondent 2	Colgan Industries Pty Ltd	69%	3
Respondent 3	Kilmore Group	84%	1

Refer to **Confidential Attachment 1** for further detail.

Price Assessment

The panel carried out an assessment of the submitted pricing offered. The original prices submitted by each Respondent was well above the approved budget. Considering this a reduced scope was developed and approved to reduce the total cost while still meeting the outcome of the required provision of repairing the roof safely.

The following two items were amended in the scope:

- Original Scope:
 - Item e) Replace the ceiling lining and bolted connections. Using a similar approach to the roof covering, provide a AZ10025 (aluminium) ceiling joist, lapped 900mm at supports. Midspan bridging is not required between these joists. The lap should consist of 2-M12 purlin bolts as per manufacturer specifications.
 - Item g) Provide an appropriate and cost-effective method of access to the roof. Methodology innovation to reduce costs and disruption are welcomed. All access must be demonstrated as compliant with all relevant safety legislation.

- Reduced Scope:
 - Item e) Access the ceiling joists when the roof sheeting has been removed and reinforce the ceiling joist to truss connection. The ceiling joist to truss connection is compromised, it is recommended to reinforce this connection with 2-12g 304 Stainless Steel, Tek screws (with bonded washer) at the end of each joist. (Note: Final screw material type is being confirmed by corrosion specialist). As this fixing is into an existing connection, the screw should be installed through the aluminium and into the mild steel cleat with no additional isolation required.
 - Item g) Provide an appropriate access to the roof from rear of building. All access must be demonstrated as compliant with all relevant safety legislation.

The reduced scope did not significantly vary the scope of services or intent of the Request for Tender and was distributed to the three (3) Respondents. The Respondents were requested to confirm that the reduced scope could be achieved and to provide an updated pricing schedule. All three (3) Respondents provided their response within the allocated timeframe.

The panel conducted an assessment on the reduced scope price and reviewed the scores in the original evaluation. The panel agreed that the reduced scope responses did not affect the original qualitative scores. All scores remained unchanged.

Respondent #	Respondent Name	Rank
Respondent 1	Barpa Pty Ltd	3
Respondent 2	Colgan Industries Pty Ltd	2
Respondent 3	Kilmore Group	1

Evaluation Summary

The panel concluded that the tender to the reduced scope from Kilmore Group provides value for money to the City and is therefore recommended for the provision of IE252/2023 Leederville Grandstand Roof Repair for the following reasons:

- Compliance with the submission requirements;
- Ranked first in the qualitative assessment;
- Ranked first in the pricing assessment;
- References conducted and verified claims; and
- Pricing demonstrates value for money.

It is therefore recommended that Council accepts the tender submitted by Kilmore Group for Tender IE252/2023 Leederville Grandstand Roof Repair.

CONSULTATION/ADVERTISING:

The Request for Tender IE252/2023 Leederville Grandstand Roof Repair was advertised in the West Australian on Saturday 18 March 2023 and on both the City's website and VendorPanel between 18 March 2023 and 14 April 2023.

LEGAL/POLICY:

The Request for Tender was prepared and advertised in accordance with:

- Section 3.57 of the Local Government Act 1995;
- Part 4 of the Local Government (Functions and General) Regulations 1996; and
- City of Vincent Purchasing Policy.

RISK MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS

Low: It is low risk for Council to accept the preferred Respondent.

STRATEGIC IMPLICATIONS:

This is in keeping with the City's *Strategic Community Plan 2022-2032*:

Enhanced Environment

Our parks and reserves are maintained, enhanced and are accessible for all members of the community.

Connected and Healthy Community

Our community facilities and spaces are well known and well used.

Thriving Places

Our town centres and gathering spaces are safe, easy to use and attractive places where pedestrians have priority.

Innovative and Accountable

Our decision-making process is consistent and transparent, and decisions are aligned to our strategic direction.

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS:

This does not contribute to any specific sustainability outcomes of the City's Sustainable Environment Strategy 2019-2024, although the sustainability and environmental management practices of Respondents was a weighted qualitative criteria of this request, and the preferred Respondent provided some evidence of sustainability practices.

PUBLIC HEALTH IMPLICATIONS:

This is in keeping with the following priority health outcomes of the City's *Public Health Plan 2020-2025*:

Reduced exposure to environmental health risks

FINANCIAL/BUDGET IMPLICATIONS:

The 2023/2024 annual capital works budget has \$316,000 allocated for Leederville Grandstand renewal. A total of \$497,450 is required for this contract, leaving a shortfall of approximately \$182,000. It is recommended that the City submits the Leederville Grandstand roof renewal as project nomination for the Phase 4 LRCI program funding of \$270,557.

This would increase the total budget to \$586,557 for this project. The surplus amount will allow for project contingency and once the project is completed any remaining surplus funds can be considered by Council at the mid-year budget review.

COMMENTS:

The tender submission from Kilmore Group complies with all tender requirements. The submission was well presented and included all relevant and specific information required and requested within the tender specification.

The Evaluation Panel deemed the response to be of an excellent standard, convincing and credible, demonstrating the capability, capacity and experience for key evaluation criteria.