

10.3 RESPONSE TO PETITION - DEMOLITION OF BANKS RESERVE PAVILION

- Attachments:**
1. 1 July 2021 Email Update
 2. 16 July 2021 Email Update

RECOMMENDATION:

That Council:

1. **NOTES the update on the Banks Reserve Pavilion rationalisation project;**
2. **NOTES that the demolition of the pavilion is a project that is scheduled to occur in 2021; and**
3. **NOTES that the provision of a community meeting space will be considered as part of the detailed design of the proposed Banks Reserve Plaza.**

PURPOSE OF REPORT:

To provide Council with an update in response to the petition received from Leon Pericles on 1 July by 2021.

BACKGROUND:

The City's Corporate Business Plan 2017/18 – 2020/21 included an action to prepare a Master Plan for Banks Reserve. The draft Banks Reserve Master Plan was prepared based upon extensive community and stakeholder consultation, including:

- 'A Week in the Life Study' with the Project Consultant observing Reserve activities and liaising with Reserve users (January 2018)
- Project Postcards sent to local residents within a 400 metre radius of the Reserve (March 2018)
- Master Plan Pop-Up Consultation with 50 people attending onsite at the Reserve (March 2018)
- Master Plan Pop-Up Consultation at PetFest, Close The Gap Day Festival, and Beatty Park Leisure Centre (March to April 2018)
- Online Master Plan Survey that attracted 400 visits to the EHQ portal and 64 survey responses (March to April 2018)
- Community Reference Group Workshops including Council Member, Administration, Banks Precinct Action Group, Perth Paddlers Kayak Club, and local community representatives (April to May 2018)
- One-on-one engagement meetings with the Department of Biodiversity Conservation and Attractions, Department of Local Government Sport and Cultural Industries, City of Perth, City of Bayswater, Western Power, Claisebrook Town Team, Metropolitan Redevelopment Authority and Venueslive.
- Attendance at Council's Arts Advisory Group, Urban Mobility Advisory Group, Reconciliation Action Plan Working Group, and Children and Young People Advisory Group Meetings.
- Attendance at the Whadjuk Working Party Meetings in November 2017 and May 2018.

The resulting key outcomes for this project included:

- Retain and maintain natural features of the site and used subtle design features
- Acknowledge the cultural significance of the site
- Playground, lighting and toilet improvements are key short-term deliverables
- Alignment with the Foreshore Restoration Project
- Coordination with medium to long term plans for surrounding development, including the Old East Perth Power Station
- Deliver car parking improvements without negatively impacting the site
- Explore opportunities for an upgraded café/commercial building with community elements
- Support pop-up capabilities to maximise surrounding activities, including Optus Stadium foot traffic

Council considered the draft Banks Reserve Master Plan at its Council Briefing Session on [6 November 2018](#) and the Ordinary Council Meeting of [13 November 2018](#). At the Ordinary Council Meeting, Council authorised the Banks Reserve Master Plan for public comment.

Between 14 November and 28 November 2018, the draft Banks Reserve Master Plan was advertised through the following media:

- Imagine Vincent
- Social media
- Two local newspapers
- Direct emails to previous survey respondents, project reference group and key stakeholders
- Signs at Administration Centre, Beatty Park and Library
- Postcards to all residents 400m of Banks Reserve
- Signage at Banks Reserve
- Notice in November 2018 e-newsletter

35 submissions were received with 23 people in support, nine opposed and three unsure. A report was then presented to Council Briefing Session on [4 December 2018](#) and the Ordinary Council Meeting of [11 December 2018](#), showing no changes to the draft Master Plan. Some comments were received around keeping the existing hall at comment nos. 1, 37 and 40 with Administration's primary response as follows:

Feedback received during preparation of the Master Plan highlighted that the current facility design, location and condition did not meet community needs. The building does not comply with current accessibility and compliance standards, and is nearing the end of its useful asset life.

The decision on the draft Master Plan was deferred to February 2019 to allow respondents to be notified of the upcoming Council meeting. Following this meeting, Administration reopened advertising to allow additional comments between 14 December 2018 and 16 January 2019. A total of 54 comments were received across both consultations, with 31 in support, 12 opposed and 11 unsure.

The revised Master Plan was presented to Council Briefing on [26 February 2019](#) and the Ordinary Council Meeting of [5 March 2019](#).

A number of new comments arose during this extended period including additional comments around the Banks Reserve Pavilion utilisation rates, as follows:

Numerous comments were received regarding the current and potential utilisation of the Banks Reserve Pavilion. While the Pavilion has been assessed as being in 'fair' condition it does not meet current accessibility and public building standards. Many of the building components are rapidly nearing end of life with required works to bring the Pavilion up to a reasonable standard being extensive and costly. It would cost approx. \$500,000 simply to bring the Pavilion up to a reasonable, compliant standard without achieving any functional improvements. Approximately \$35,000 is spent per annum on building maintenance but this does not address the current accessibility or public building deficiencies. It is anticipated that these building maintenance costs will continue to increase over time as the building components reach end of life.

Administration has again assessed current Pavilion utilisation (2018 data provided below). While the facility occupancy rate is quite high this is primarily due to the existing Kiddies Learning Hub Pty Ltd Licence Agreement that expires on 28 June 2019. Facility occupancy is significantly lower when Kiddies Learning Hub usage is excluded.

Total Usage Hours (including Kiddies Learning Hub)	Occupancy Rate	Total Usage Hours (excluding Kiddies Learning Hub)	Occupancy Rate
2,427.5	43%	447.5	8%

At the 5 March 2019 meeting, Council adopted the [Banks Reserve Master Plan](#).

The Master Plan outlines the intention to construct a "partially covered plaza space that allows a flexible range of activity and functions that can be utilised by the wider community" to replace the pavilion. The Master Plan also indicates demolition of the Pavilion for the 2020/21 financial year.

Adoption of Budget at [28 July 2020](#) OCM included demolition of Banks Reserve Pavilion (included in Parks and Reserves Operating Account) in line with the Master Plan. Demolition of the pavilion was originally scheduled to take place in the first six months of 2021. Preparations were made last financial year for the

building to be demolished and replaced with green open space but public interest in the demolition resulted in the works being postponed and the budget being carried forward to 2021/22.

From 14 April 2021, residents were invited to a Q&A session on site on 1 May 2021 about the future of Banks Reserve via email and a letter delivered to approximately 300 households surrounding Banks Reserve. The email list was drawn from people who had commented on the Banks Reserve Master Plan via Imagine Vincent and additional people who had recently been in contact regarding the pavilion. That meeting was attended by the Mayor, Deputy Member, Elected Members and City staff. The meeting also coincided with a pop up community engagement event on the City's draft *Asset Management and Sustainability Strategy* which was held to coincide at the same location.

On 1 July, a public notice appeared in the Perth Voice, The West Australian, City Noticeboards and the City's website advising that the pavilion was scheduled to be demolished 20 July 2021.

Later, on 1 July 2021, Leon Pericles submitted a **petition to the City with 446 signatures** stating as follows:

"The Banks Reserve Pavilion, which sits in a rare and unique position on the one of the most beautiful walks on the swan river, is slated for demolition by the City of Vincent Council. We are appealing to the community to support our demand that it NOT be demolished but instead be given new life to support the health and wellbeing of our community.

We urgently need to make a call to stop the demolition. It would be devastating to remove a beautiful and functional community space. The cost to replace such a space means we will never see a new community building built and the opportunity for revitalisation will be lost.

This building has been successfully used for years: for example as a children's preschool for many years earning the council more than enough income to pay for any upkeep. The council could easily find tenants and uses for this versatile building. Community support is so great that we have already compiled a very long list of respected professionals that will donate their time and expertise to launching the space with free classes, seminars and workshops.

Just a few of the VIPs who have committed to giving their time in support of building this community hub: Artist Leon Pericles, Film Producer Celia Tate, TV Presenter Calinda Anderson, Former Head of Music at UWA Mark Coughlan, Former CEO of Perth Zoo John De Jose, Businessman Steven Drake-Brockman, former Politician Peter Foss, Artist Kylie Rath, Bookshop Owner Robert Muir, the list goes on and will only grow..."

The full text with updates is available at change.org. It appears that the petition commenced prior to the community meeting that took place on the 1 May 2021.

Later, on 1 July 2021, an email about the demolition was sent to the original email list plus people who had written email addresses down at the Q&A session (missing nine people whose emails were missed or incorrectly transcribed). This was supposed to be sent prior to the demolition notice being published, included as **Attachment 1**.

On 16 July 2021, an update was sent to the same mailing list as 1 July, advising the petition was received and the demolition would be delayed pending a Council Briefing and Meeting. A follow up email was sent on 21 July 2021 to the nine people who had been missed off the list to advise of the 27 July 2021 OCM.

DETAILS:

Removal of the existing Banks Pavilion is to create an open plaza area incorporating recreational and commercial options that will increase activation and ensure multi-purpose use of the area. Removing the existing building provides the opportunity to consolidate the built forms into a compact linear passage. The proposed implementation plan outlined in the Master Plan states for the Plaza zone:

Title of works	Year	Estimate cost	Comments
Building demolition	2020/2021	\$50,000	Existing pavilion demolished
Plaza, beach area, car park	2020/2021	\$430,000	
Lighting	2020/2021	\$140,000	Lighting incorporated into new plaza
Toilets, kayak and container cafe	2021/2022	\$300,000	

Subsequent to the on-site meeting, further work was carried out to investigate options for maintaining a community facility in some form on the site.

Scenario 1: Retain and Renew Pavilion

Retention and upgrade of the existing building was considered through the master planning process and determined not to be a feasible option.

Since many of the building components are nearing end of life, the cost to bring the Pavilion to a reasonable standard would be approximately \$500,000.

The pavilion is located in a riverbank flood zone and the likelihood of having a Development or Building Application approved for major improvements or changes is low.

In accordance with the Master Plan and previous Council reports and decisions, Administration recommends not to proceed with this option.

Scenario 2: Defer Demolition

The second scenario considered was to defer the demolition and retain the pavilion in its current state for a period of time. This review demonstrated, for example, that in order to retain the pavilion for a further four years the City would incur lifecycle costs of approximately \$210,000 (not including any allowance for waste collection, utility charges or capital renewal). In this scenario, the remaining asbestos would be left in the building and the City would not install air conditioning.

Scenario 3: Partial Demolition

The third scenario considered was partial demolition of the building and retention of the community hall. This option involved the demolition of the existing toilets and kitchen, retaining the hall and constructing a single universal access toilet and a small kitchenette within the footprint of the existing hall. The cost of the demolition and building works for this option was estimated to be \$91,000. In this scenario asbestos would not initially be removed from the hall and air conditioning would not be installed. Annual lifecycle costs were calculated at \$36,000 per annum (cleaning, maintenance and capital renewal) although this figure does not include any allowance for waste collection and utility charges as these depend on building utilisation and are difficult to estimate. The scenario contemplates future removal of the asbestos to coincide with roof sheeting renewal at an estimated additional cost of \$30,000. Officers also strongly recommended that a palisade fence was installed (similar to the current fence that provides protection to the building) at an additional cost of \$13,250.

Scenario 4: New Facility with Meeting Space

The final scenario considered was the inclusion of a meeting space in the future Plaza area which is currently a high level concept and subject to further detailed design work. This final design could include an indoor meeting space, which could be opened up to the Plaza for indoor/outdoor community gatherings, hire and recreational use. This proposal is in line with the Master Plan.

Administration continues to support the removal of the pavilion and creation of more public open space as part of the implementation of the Banks Reserve Masterplan due to the identified issues with the location; historical under-utilisation of the facility; dated infrastructure; and the potential costs involved in full or partial retention in the short and long term for no clear benefit.

That work will continue in 2021/22 with the City undertaking the work required to make an application under the Aboriginal Heritage Act in order to get consent to construct a plaza. The intention is to convert this area to public open space while this work is carried out, consent is sought and budget secured.

Administration will continue to explore an indoor/outdoor meeting place within the plaza design in further consultation with the community.

The upcoming works at Banks Reserve also closely align with the City's draft Asset Management and Sustainability Strategy (AMSS), which addresses the City's need to deal with ageing and underused buildings in a way that is sustainable, affordable and fit for purpose. The draft AMSS can be viewed at imagine.vincent.wa.gov.au

Other facilities are also currently available for hire on an hourly basis. The following table sets out May 2021 occupancy levels:

1 st – 31 st May	Number Individual hirers	Number of bookings	Total number hours booked	Occupancy	Total income received
Menzies Park Pavilion	6	24	109.5	25%	\$1,163.00
Mount Hawthorn Lesser Hall	28	68	168.75	39%	\$4,010.75
Mount Hawthorn Main Hall	13	38	130.75	30%	\$3,792.38
North Perth Lesser Hall	22	51	125	29%	\$3,016.50
North Perth Town Hall	21	33	107.75	25%	\$2,831.58
Royal Park Hall	13	34	94.25	22%	\$2,901.35
Woodville Reserve Pavilion	9	58	115.75	27%	\$1,326.15

CONSULTATION/ADVERTISING:

The development of the Banks Reserve Masterplan involved an extensive public consultation process prior to its adoption by Council. In preparation for demolition of the pavilion a public notice was originally placed on the building and more recently a public notice in relation to the demolition that was to take place on the 20 July was advertised in the local press.

There will be further community engagement as part of the detailed design process for the proposed Banks Reserve Plaza.

LEGAL/POLICY:

The demolition of the Banks Reserve pavilion is contained in the adopted Banks Reserve Masterplan and supported by the City's draft Asset Management and Sustainability Strategy.

RISK MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS

Low/Medium: It is low risk for Council to proceed with the implementation of the Banks Reserve Masterplan. There is a medium risk of community concern about the removal of the building prior to finalisation of the design for the plaza.

STRATEGIC IMPLICATIONS:

This is in keeping with the City's *Strategic Community Plan 2018-2028*:

Thriving Places

Our physical assets are efficiently and effectively managed and maintained.

Innovative and Accountable

Our resources and assets are planned and managed in an efficient and sustainable manner.

SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS:

This proposal and the future plaza proposal would result in the creation of green spaces in line with the sustainability outcomes of the *City's Sustainable Environment Strategy 2019-2024*:

- Loss of urban vegetation and tree canopy is reduced and the planting of additional trees and shrubs is increased.

PUBLIC HEALTH IMPLICATIONS:

By demolishing the pavilion and creating new green spaces, this proposal contributes to the following priority health outcome of the City's *Public Health Plan 2020-2025*:

- Deliver active and passive parks, playgrounds and additional public open spaces for all ages and abilities to enjoy.

FINANCIAL/BUDGET IMPLICATIONS:

The financial implications of potential scenarios for retention of the pavilion (full and part) are detailed in the report.

Jordan Koroveshi

Subject: RE: Banks Reserve Pavilion and Plaza update

On 1 Jul 2021, at 7:29 pm, City of Vincent <mail@vincent.wa.gov.au> wrote:

[View this email in your browser](#)

Dear Vincent community member,

On 1 May we held a Q&A session with local community members to discuss future plans for Banks Reserve and concerns raised by community members over the scheduled demolition of the Banks Reserve Pavilion.

Prior to the meeting, the City of Vincent had planned to start works in June, to replace the Banks Reserve Pavilion with green open space in preparation for a community plaza to connect to the river front. The removal of the pavilion was included in the Banks Reserve Master Plan, which was consulted on during late 2018, early 2019 and endorsed by Council in March 2019.

I would like to thank you for coming to this meeting and for expressing your views, experiences of using the pavilion and your desire for a community meeting place to remain at Banks Reserve.

Your feedback is important and we understand the passion felt for retention of the pavilion and for a community hub at Banks Reserve.

As a result of this meeting, the demolition of the pavilion was halted to further investigate options for maintaining an indoor community building.

Council Members and I requested the following options be considered:

1. Full retention of the Banks Reserve Pavilion – long term or short term

When City of Vincent makes changes to the structure of a public building, we are required to bring it up to code (Building Code of Australia and the various Australian Standards) inclusive of meeting disability access, toilets, kitchens, electrical, fire egress and asbestos removal, as well as meeting the community's expectations in respect to modern amenity and aesthetics.

As the pavilion is located in a riverbank flood zone, the likelihood of having a Development or Building Application approved for major improvements or changes is low.

We then considered retention of the pavilion, in its current state, until such time as the plaza concept was developed and implemented. The building would not have air conditioning and the asbestos in the roof lining would remain in situ. Over a 4 year period, the lifecycle cost would be an estimated \$210,000.

The previous community use of the pavilion (not including private use by the Montessori school) was 8 per cent. The estimated annual operational costs are \$25,000 (cleaning and repairs), not including waste collection, insurance or utility charges.

2. Partial retention of the Banks Reserve Pavilion (Northern section)

Partial retention of the hall structure was also considered. This would involve demolition of the U-shaped toilets and storage areas and construction of one universally accessible toilet and kitchenette within the northern hall footprint. A fence around the building for security and a number of other compliance upgrades changes would also be required.

The estimated cost of retaining the hall, partially demolishing the remaining structure, and making good is approximately \$195,000. This would be a temporary solution, as the building would require ongoing upgrades and still contain asbestos.

3. Inclusion of an indoor meeting place within the Plaza

The Banks Reserve Master Plan includes a high level concept for the Plaza area, which is subject to further detailed design.

Council Members requested this work includes consideration of an indoor meeting space, which can be closed when weather is inclement and otherwise opened up to the Plaza for indoor/outdoor community gatherings, hire and recreational use. This would be integrated into the plaza design, away from the flood zone and would achieve the Master Plan vision of opening up the parkland to the riverfront whilst offering a contemporary meeting place for the community.

Future Plans

Based on the issues of location, historical under-utilisation of the facility, dated infrastructure and significant maintenance and 'make good' costs for full or partial retention in the long and short term, Council Members did not seek to rescinded the decision made in 2019 to remove the pavilion.

Instead, we believe the best option is to explore an indoor/outdoor meeting place within the plaza design, in further consultation with the community.

Given the significance of Banks Reserve, we will work through a process of consent under the Aboriginal Heritage Act before a plaza is created. The area is being converted to open space and lawn while consent is sought and budget is secured. You can view the Banks Reserve Master Plan here <https://imagine.vincent.wa.gov.au/banks-reserve-master-plan>

The upcoming works at Banks Reserve do closely align with the City's draft Asset Management and Sustainability Strategy (AMSS), which addresses the City's need to deal with ageing and underused buildings in a way that is sustainable, affordable and fit for purpose. The draft AMSS can be viewed at imagine.vincent.wa.gov.au

We understand that many residents remain committed to retaining the old pavilion and will be disappointed. I assure you this hasn't been an easy decision to make. We and have taken time to consider the options carefully, weighing up all factors and seeking solutions for the long term.

We will be consulting further on the plaza and are looking to see how we can include many ideas you raised at the Q&A session.

Yours sincerely,

Emma Cole
MAYOR



Copyright © 2021 City of Vincent, All rights reserved.

You are receiving this email because you have expressed interest in being kept up to date on information relating to Banks Reserve.

Our mailing address is:

City of Vincent
Town Of Vincent
244 Vincent St
LEEDERVILLE, WA 6007
Australia

[Add us to your address book](#)

Want to change how you receive these emails?
You can [update your preferences](#) or [unsubscribe from this list](#).



From: [City of Vincent](#)
To: [Jordan Koroveshi](#)
Subject: CM9: [Test] Banks Reserve Pavilion and Plaza update - 16 July 2021
Date: Friday, 16 July 2021 4:26:17 PM

[View this email in your browser](#)

Dear Vincent community member,

Thank you for your interest in the Banks Reserve Master Plan or Banks Reserve Pavilion.

We previously scheduled demolition of the pavilion for 20 July 2021. However, since we have now received a petition objecting to the demolition, the demolition has been deferred.

Council will formally consider the petition at the 20 July 2021 Council Briefing and 27 July 2021 Council Meeting.

The Council Briefing Session provides an opportunity for Council Members to ask questions and discuss the item, while the Council Meeting is the forum for making a formal decision on the item.

The meetings will take place at 6pm at the City's Administration and Civic Centre. The meeting will be live streamed, via <https://www.vincent.wa.gov.au/council-meetings/livestream>

Please contact governance@vincent.wa.gov.au if you have any questions.

Regards,

Jordan Koroveshi
A/Executive Manager Corporate Strategy and Governance



Copyright © 2021 City of Vincent, All rights reserved.

You are receiving this email because you have expressed interest in being kept up to date on information relating to Banks Reserve.