



CITY OF VINCENT

HERITAGE ASSESSMENT



Address: Nos. 68-70 Cowle Street, West Perth				
Precinct: N/A		Place Name: N/A		
Folio: 17	Lot: 41	D/P: 46440	Vol. 1375	Land Use: House

STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE:

The place has *little aesthetic value* as a result of a fire damage. A number of key structural heritage features of the Late Colonial Georgian working class house are no longer identifiable.

The place had *some historic value* as it is part of a streetscape of original nineteenth century dwellings which show the evolution of the locality.

MANAGEMENT CATEGORY:

The place is listed on the Municipal Heritage Inventory as a Management Category A - Conservation Essential (Adoption Date: 29 December 2006).

ADMINISTRATION RECOMMENDATION:

Delete the place from the City's Municipal Heritage Inventory.

The subject place was extensively damaged as a result of a fire on 13 September 2015. Given that the structural integrity of the place has failed to the point where it cannot be rectified without the removal of a number of key structural components including front verandah, chimneys and rear walls, Administration supports the deletion of the place from the Municipal Heritage Inventory, as detailed in the Structural Inspection Report.

It is considered that deletion of the place from the MHI is in accordance with the City's Policy No. 7.6.5 relating to Heritage Management – Amendments to the Municipal Heritage Inventory (MHI) which states,

“Deletion of a place from MHI will only be considered if a structural condition report conducted by a registered structural engineers states that the structural integrity of the place has failed to the point where it cannot be rectified without the removal of a majority of its significant fabric.”

1.0 ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

The Policy ‘*Heritage Management – Assessment*’, adopted by the Council at its Ordinary Meeting held on 17 January 2006 and amended on 10 July 2012, has been used to determine the cultural heritage significance of the place.

1.1 PRINCIPAL HISTORIC THEMES

- Population and settlement

HISTORIC SUB THEMES

- Residential development

1.2 AESTHETIC VALUE

The place has *little aesthetic value* as a result of a fire damage. A number of key structural heritage features of the Late Colonial Georgian working class house are no longer identifiable.

1.3 HISTORIC VALUE

The place had *some historic value* as it is part of a streetscape of original nineteenth century dwellings which show the evolution of the locality.

1.4 SCIENTIFIC VALUE

The place had *little scientific value*. There is no obvious potential for the place to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of the natural or cultural history of the City.

1.5 SOCIAL VALUE

The place had *little social value*. It contributes in a minor way to the community's sense of place.

2.0 DEGREE OF SIGNIFICANCE**2.1 RARITY**

The place had *some rarity value* as an example of the Late Colonial Georgian style, of which there are only a limited number remaining in the locality.

2.2 REPRESENTATIVENESS

The place as an example of the Late Colonial Georgian style was *representative* of the characteristics of a class of cultural places within the City of Vincent that relates to a period of development prior to the Gold Rush period.

2.3 CONDITION

The condition of the place is considered *poor*. The level of fire-related structural damage is considered to be extensive.

2.4 INTEGRITY

The place has a *low* degree of integrity. The residual structural integrity of the fire-damaged components has been sufficiently compromised to consider complete demolition.

2.5 AUTHENTICITY

The place has a *low* degree of authenticity. There appears to be limited opportunity for salvaging a number of key original structural heritage components.

3.0 SUPPORTING EVIDENCE**3.1 DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE**

The semi-detached pair was known as Pastel House and these were always rented out¹. The subject dwellings form part of the Roworth Estate acquired through a transfer of land between the City of Perth and Mr A R Roworth in the 1970's.²

¹ Main, A. 2002, *A History of Cowle Street, West Perth Western Australia*, unpublished report.

² City of Vincent MHI, Place Record Form 70-70A Cowle Street, West Perth. Further detail refer to City of Vincent Nos. 68-70 Cowle Street Heritage Assessment 2006.

3.2 PHYSICAL EVIDENCE

Before fire damage

Before the fire damage, the dwellings consisted a mirrored pair, which had symmetrical façades. The front doors were located in the centre of the façade, next to the party wall. A sash window was located on each side of the dwelling.

The dwelling was constructed from rendered brick and corrugated iron which has been painted green. The façade had been painted a cream colour and grooves had been etched into the render to give the appearance of large blocks. The corrugated iron sheeting on the roof and verandah was in short sheets. The roof extends to form a skillion front verandah which was supported by sets of two slender classical columns, mounted on piers located at the middle and ends of the verandah. A rendered balustrade ran along the front of the dwelling, between the piers and was situated on the front boundary. Another balustrade separated the front of the two dwellings and ended in a pier on the property boundary.

Each side of the pair had two chimneys with corbelled tops. At the rear of the dwellings was a weatherboard skillion roof extension.³

After fire damage

The subject place was damaged as a result of a fire on 13 September 2015. A Structural Inspection Report conducted by Wood & Grieve Engineers indicates that the residual structural integrity of the fire-damaged components has been sufficiently compromised to consider complete demolition.⁴

The key observations from Wood & Grieve Engineers were as follows:

- Extensive damage is evident throughout generally.
- The timber roof has been completely destroyed as a result of the fire and remaining timber members are largely charred and/or missing.
- The loss of timber roof members has removed all lateral restraint to the free-standing masonry walls. As a result, the stability of most walls have been compromised and there is a risk of collapse of existing masonry walls in some areas in the current condition.
- Cracking to existing walls was apparent in a number of locations. This is likely to have been caused by lateral wall movement and subsidence.
- The sub-floor structure appears to have been extensively damaged in a number of areas.
- The majority the timber lintels have been irreparably damaged. Tell-tales signs of masonry distress such as cracking and sagging are evident in some area as a result. These areas are at risk of further damage and/or collapse.
- Extensive render damage is evident throughout generally and little remains of existing timber window and door frames.
- Extensive temporary stabilisation work would be required to safe-guard the existing walls against potential collapse prior to occupying adjoining properties and allowing access to site.

³ Further detail refer to City of Vincent Nos. 68-70 Cowle Street Heritage Assessment 2006.

⁴ Structural Inspection Report conducted by Wood & Grieve Engineers dated 4 November 2015.

The Structural Inspection Report concludes, *'There appears to be limited opportunity for salvaging a number of key structural (and possibly heritage) components (including chimney, the rear wall of the dwellings and front verandas all of which would require full or partial demolition) and the complexity of the temporary works required to adequately stabilise the structure for the safety of adjoining buildings and public footpaths presents additional risk, which can only be completely eliminated if full demolition is considered as an option.'*

Streetscape

A new development comprises the construction of three storey multiple dwellings is currently underway to the east of the subject place, along Nos. 28-48 Cowle Street. The heritage listed building at Nos. 28-30 Cowle Street is proposed to be retained.

Administration Recommendation

Given the above, Administration supports the deletion of Nos. 68-70 Cowle Street from the Municipal Heritage Inventory.

3.3 REFERENCES

City Gardener's Reports and Instructions, July 1926 (actually 1936) - Dec 1937, Perth City Council, Files WA 72, 23/1936, 62/1938.

City of Vincent Nos. 68-70 Cowle Street 2006.

City of Vincent Municipal Heritage Inventory, Place Record Form Nos. 70-70A Cowle Street, West Perth.

Hocking Planning and Architecture Collaboration, 2004, *City of Vincent Municipal Heritage Inventory - Draft Thematic History*, Unpublished Report
Main, A. 2002, *A History of Cowle Street, West Perth Western Australia*, unpublished report.

Sewerage Plan 87, MWSSD Cons 4156, 1958.

Structural Inspection Report conducted by Wood & Grieve Engineers dated 4 November 2015.

The Western Australian Post Office Directory, Wise and Co, 1893-1949 editions.

Appendix 1: Maps/Plans



Appendix 2: Photographs

Before fire damage (photographs taken on 29 September 2006)



Appendix 2: Photographs

After fire damage (photographs taken in September and November 2015)

